Issues in History Teaching

This book covers a wide range of important issues relating to history education, ranging from justifying the place of history in the curriculum to using information technology in the classroom. The book attempts to incorporate every relevant major issue, including such topics as:

- what should be included in the history curriculum;
- good practice in history teaching;
- Government policies on history matters;
- the links between teaching history and learning about citizenship;
- history and special educational needs.

Written by a range of history professionals, including HMs, this book offers new and interesting ideas on the teaching, learning and organisation of history in primary and secondary schools.

Professor James Arthur is Professor of Education at Canterbury Christ Church University College. Dr Robert Phillips is Lecturer in Education at the University of Wales, Swansea.
Issues in Subject Teaching series
Series edited by Susan Capel, Jon Davison, James Arthur and John Moss

Other titles in the series:
Issues in Design and Technology Teaching
Issues in English Teaching
Issues in Geography Teaching
Issues in Physical Education Teaching
Issues in Modern Foreign Languages Teaching
Issues in Music Teaching
Issues in Religious Education Teaching
Issues in Teaching Using ICT
Issues in History Teaching

Edited by James Arthur
and Robert Phillips

London and New York
Contents

List of illustrations xi
Notes on contributors xiii
Introduction to the Series xvii

1 What are the issues in the teaching of history? 1
   JAMES ARTHUR
   The History Task Group, 1998–9  2
   A collection of issues  4

2 Government policies, the State and the teaching of history 10
   ROBERT PHILLIPS
   Introduction  10
   ‘Why do governments fear history?’  10
   ‘An inherited consensus’?  12
   ‘A host of malignant sprites’?  13
   ‘The battle for the big prize’?  15
   ‘Four histories, one nation’?  17
   ‘The end of history and the last history teacher’?  21
   Acknowledgements  23
   Questions  23
   Further reading  23

3 Curriculum decision-making in the primary school: 24
   the place of history
   PENELope HARNETT
   Why teach history in the primary school?  25
   What history should primary school children learn?  26
   How should history be taught in the primary school?  28
   1988: the Education Reform Act and the history National Curriculum  30
Contents

Back to basics? History within the contemporary primary curriculum 32
Into the millennium 35
Questions 36
Further reading 36

PART 1
Issues in the classroom

4 Teaching historical significance 39
MARTIN HUNT
Introduction 39
The case for emphasising significance in the teaching of history 39
What educational outcomes arise from the study of significance in history? 42
What are the potential problems in the learning of significance? 44
What strategies can be used in the teaching of significance in history? 48
Conclusion 52
Questions 52
Further reading 53

5 Historical knowledge and historical skills: a distracting dichotomy 54
CHRISTINE COUNSELL
Introduction 54
Skill and knowledge: an uneasy alliance 54
The problem with "skill" 56
The problem with knowledge 60
Making the abstract interesting: the role of status and structure 63
Conclusion: beyond knowledge and "skill" 70
Questions 71
Further reading 71

6 Teaching about interpretations 72
TONY MCALEAVY
Introduction 72
Interpretations of history and the English and Welsh history curriculum 72
A variety of interpretations 73
Opportunities for work on interpretations 75
What can we ask students to do? 76
Interpretations and the 1995 review of the National Curriculum 77
Interpretations at GCSE 79
Interpretations and citizenship 81
Discussion Points 82
Further reading 82

7 Issues in the teaching of chronology 83
WILLIAM STOW AND TERRY HAYDN
Introduction 83
Why chronology is an issue in history teaching 83
The importance of chronology in the teaching of history 85
What does research indicate about children’s understanding of historical time? 88
How can children’s understanding of time be developed? 91
What for history teachers are the key implications of these issues? 95
Further reading 97

8 Information and communications technology in the history classroom 98
TERRY HAYDN
Introduction 98
Why ICT is an issue in history teaching 98
Getting beyond ‘the usual suspects’ 100
The advantages and limitations of ICT in the history classroom:
the importance of instructional design over technological advance 102
Adjusting to the information-rich history classroom 103
Interactivity, new technology and the history classroom 104
Key applications and views forward in ICT and history 106
CD-ROMs 108
The Internet and communications technology 109
The medium is not the message 110
Further reading 112

9 History teaching, literacy and special educational needs 113
WENDY CUNNAH
History for adults, the able or all? 113
Differentiation: resolving the mismatch 115
Thinking through difficulties: facing the challenge 117
Challenges for aspiring history teachers 121
Questions 124
Further reading 124
10  Thinking and feeling: pupils' preconceptions about the past and historical understanding  125
CHRIS HUSBANDS AND ANNA PENDRY

Introduction  125
Pupil writing and historical understanding: sixteenth-century religion  126
Pupils' understandings and preconceptions: an analysis  129
Pupils' historical ideas and classroom tasks  130
Linking classroom history, the pupil and her ideas  131
Acknowledgements  134
Questions  134
Further reading  134

PART II
Broader educational issues and history

11  Citizenship and the teaching and learning of history  137
IAN DAVIES

Introduction  137
The status and meaning of education for citizenship  138
Implementing citizenship education through history: the problems  140
Implementing education for citizenship through history: a way forward?  143
Conclusion  146
Questions  147
Further reading  147

12  'History for the nation': multiculturalism and the teaching of history  148
IAN GROSVENOR

Introduction  148
What is the multicultural challenge?  148
What is the current situation in schools?  150
Can an inclusive 'history for the nation' be developed within the National Curriculum?  152
Is 'history for the nation' just about content?  156
Conclusion  158
Questions  158
Further reading  158
13 Primary school history in Europe: a staple diet or a hot potato? 159
HILARY COOPER

How important is history in the primary curriculum? 159
An investigation of what young children in a range of European countries
know about the past and how they acquired that knowledge 160
Methodology 162
The findings 163
What issues arise from the project? 169
Questions 173
Further reading 174

14 History in Europe: the benefits and challenges of co-operation 175
RUTH WATTS

What European initiatives are there in the teaching and learning of
history? 175
Are such initiatives relevant to the concerns of history teachers in England and
Wales? 177
A case study: ‘Youth and History’ 179
Are European aspirations likely to enhance or distort the teaching of European
history? 182
How can history teachers in England and Wales participate more fully in
European activities in history? 185
Conclusion 186
Questions 186
Further reading 187

PART III
Issues in the training of history teachers

15 Current issues in the training of secondary history teachers:
an HMI perspective 191
CAROLE BAKER, TED COHN AND MARK MCLAUGHLIN

16 Good practice in the school-based training of history teachers 202
CAROLE BAKER, TED COHN AND MARK MCLAUGHLIN

17 Inspecting subject knowledge 211
CAROLE BAKER, TED COHN AND MARK MCLAUGHLIN

Bibliography 220
Index 235
Illustrations

Tables

2.1 Summary of history curricula in the UK 19–20
4.1 Making links with issues related to citizenship, social and moral development 45
4.2 Explanations of why the Great Fire of London is a significant event in history 49
4.3 Concept cards and possible matches 50
4.4 Reasons why the study of the slave trade and its abolition is important 51
6.1 Types of interpretation 74
6.2 Comparison of 1991 and 1995 expectations of classroom performance 78
13.1 Analysis of concept maps for Eminescu High School, Bucharest: historical sources referred to by 11-year-olds 167
13.2 Analysis of historical period referred to by 6-year-olds 167
13.3 Analysis of historical period referred to by 10-year-olds 168
13.4 Synopsis of findings: number of responses in each category across all national groups 169

Figures

5.1 A 15-year-old, 'Michael', attempts to answer a question on sources 58
13.1 Topics referred to by 6-year-olds 163
13.2 Topics referred to by 10-year-olds 164
Contributors

James Arthur is Professor of Education at Canterbury Christ Church University College and is the co-author of Learning to Teach History in the Secondary School (Routledge). He also contributed to History Teachers in the Making (Open University Press). He was a member of the National Curriculum History Task Group and previously was a member of QCA’s National Forum on Values in the Community and Education. He has written a number of books and numerous articles on educational policy in denominational schooling. He has also written Schools and Community: The Community Agenda in Education (Palmer Press) and is currently writing Social Literacy and the School Curriculum and co-authoring Citizenship Education through History, both for Palmer Press.

Hilary Cooper is Principal Lecturer in Education at St Martin’s College, Lancaster. Her doctoral thesis on ‘Young children’s thinking in history’ was an empirical study undertaken as a practising primary school teacher. She subsequently worked in the Department of Education at Goldsmith’s College, University of London and at Lancaster University before joining the University College of St Martin. She has published widely, particularly in the field of primary history education. Her books include The Teaching of History in Primary Schools (David Fulton) and History in the Early Years (Routledge). She was an editor of Teaching History, 1991-7, and is now consultant editor. Her current research interests include history education in Europe, and children’s perceptions of their learning.

Christine Counsell is Lecturer in History Education at the University of Cambridge School of Education. Her in-service training on writing and thinking skills, and her pamphlet Analytical and Discursive Writing (Historical Association), have been influential in expanding teachers’ strategies for increasing pupils’ capacity and disposition for abstract thought and extended communication. Working with Michael Riley as general editor of the new Key Stage 3 series Think Through History (Longman), she seeks to link these developments with new and systematic attempts at building both historical knowledge and critical thinking in the ‘lower-attaining’ pupil. She is currently researching the professional knowledge of secondary teachers, examining
the way in which history teachers select and conceptualise subject matter components in order to secure progression in pupils' learning.

Wendy Cummah is a Tutor on the History PGCE programme in the Department of Education, University of Wales, Swansea; she also co-ordinates the special needs programmes within the department. Her research interests focus upon special needs within history teaching.

Ian Davies is a Lecturer in Educational Studies at the University of York. His previous experience includes ten years as a teacher in comprehensive schools in England. He now teaches undergraduates in educational studies (non-QTS), is responsible for the PGCE History course at York, and supervises MA and DPhil research. He is the co-editor of Developing European Citizens (Sheffield Hallam University Press), the co-author of Using Documents (English Heritage) and has published many articles in academic and professional journals.

Ian Grosvenor lectures in History in Education at the School of Education, University of Birmingham. He was formerly Principal Lecturer in Education (Research) at Nene University College, Northampton and Head of History at Newman College of Higher Education, Birmingham. He has taught in primary, secondary and special schools, worked on Local Education Authority anti-racist initiatives, and worked in equal opportunities programmes. He has published articles on the teaching of history, post-1945 Education Policy, Recent books include Assimilating Identities: Racism and Education Policy in Post-1945 Britain (Lawrence & Wishart) and Silences and Images. The Social History of the Classroom, the latter edited with Martin Lawn and Kate Rousmaniere (Peter Lang).

Penelope Harnett is Senior Lecturer in Primary Education at the University of the West of England, Bristol. Her research interests include the development of primary school children's historical understanding, with particular reference to children's interpretations of visual images. As a Research Fellow at the University of the West of England, Penelope has explored the development of the history curriculum in primary schools during this century and primary school teachers' perceptions of the current history curriculum. She is editor of Primary History and has also published teaching materials and children's books.

Terry Haydn is Lecturer in Education and Course Director of the Secondary PGCE Course at the School of Education and Professional Development at the University of East Anglia. He is co-author of Learning to Teach History in the Secondary School (Routledge). His research interests are in the field of new technology and the history classroom, pupils' understanding of time, and the working atmosphere in the classroom. He was a Head of Humanities
in an inner-city comprehensive school in Manchester before working for several years as a PGCE tutor at the Institute of Education, University of London.

Martin Hunt is currently a part-time Lecturer on the PGCE History course at the Diocesan School of Education, Manchester Metropolitan University, where he was formerly a Principal Lecturer and Course Leader of the one-year PGCE course. He is a co-author of Learning to Teach History in the Secondary School (Routledge). He was the Chief Examiner for the GCSE Local History syllabus (1988–97) and is currently a Principal Examiner for the GCSE.

Chris Husbands is Professor of Education at the University of Warwick. He taught in schools in London, Norwich and Hertfordshire, and in teacher education at the University of East Anglia. He is author of What is History Teaching? (Open University Press) and co-author of History Teachers in the Making (Open University Press). He is co-director of the ESRC Project on Teacher, Parent and Pupil Attitudes to Affective Education in the EU.

Tony McAloney is Principal Inspector for Schools of Gloucestershire County Council LEA and has written widely in the field of history education, including a series of school textbooks. He has a background in secondary history teaching and has acted as a history consultant for QCA.

Anna Pendry is a Lecturer in Educational Studies at the University of Oxford, where she works with PGCE, higher degree and research students. Her research interests are in the field of teacher education, and especially the learning of beginning teachers. She is the co-author of History Teachers in the Making, published by Open University Press.

Robert Phillips is Lecturer in Education at the University of Wales, Swansea. He has written extensively on aspects of history education in England and in Wales. His main research interest focuses on the connection between the teaching of history and the cultivation of national identity. He has recently published a book on this theme entitled History Teaching, Nationhood and the State: A Study in Educational Politics (Cassell).

William Stow is currently a Senior Lecturer at Canterbury Christ Church University College, where he is responsible for undergraduate and postgraduate primary history training. He has recently completed a Masters in Education, for which the dissertation focused on the development of primary children's understanding of chronology. He is currently studying for a Ph.D., focusing on history teaching and the primary child's sense of chronology in Sweden, Scotland and England.
Ruth Watts is a Senior Lecturer in Education and History Methods Tutor in the School of Education, University of Birmingham. Her research interests are in the history of education, women's history and the teaching of history, and she has published on each of these. She is co-editor of Crossing the Key Stages of History (David Fulton) and has recently published Gender, Power and the Unitarians in England, 1760–1860.

HMI (England) authors

Carole Baker, Ted Cohn and Mark McLaughlin

Prior to joining the inspectorate, each HMI (England) had significant experience at various levels in education, including in schools, higher education, in-service training and adult education. As an HMI for over fifteen years, each has inspected widely in schools, further education and higher education, including teacher training. Inspection of teacher training involves not only the initial training of teachers, but also the induction of newly qualified teachers and the further professional development of longer serving teachers. In addition, each has written a substantial number of published surveys as well as reports on individual institutions or courses.
Introduction to the Series

This book, Issues in History Teaching, is one of a series of books entitled Issues in Subject Teaching. The series has been designed to engage with a wide range of issues related to subject teaching. Types of issues vary among subjects, but may include, for example: issues that impact on Initial Teacher Education in the subject; issues addressed in the classroom through the teaching of the subject; issues to do with the content of the subject and its definition; issues to do with subject pedagogy; issues to do with the relationship between the subject and broader educational aims and objectives in society, and the philosophy and sociology of education; and issues to do with the development of the subject and its future in the twenty-first century.

Each book consequently presents key debates that subject teachers will need to understand, reflect on and engage in as part of their professional development. Chapters have been designed to highlight major questions, to consider the evidence from research and practice and to arrive at possible answers. Some subject books or chapters offer at least one solution or a view of the ways forward, whereas others provide alternative views and leave readers to identify their own solution or view of the ways forward. The editors expect readers of the series to want to pursue the issues raised, and so chapters include suggestions for further reading, and questions for further debate. The chapters and questions could be used as stimuli for debate in subject seminars or department meetings, or as topics for assignments or classroom research. The books are targeted at all those with a professional interest in the subject, and in particular: student teachers learning to teach the subject in the primary or secondary school; newly qualified teachers; teachers with a subject co-ordination or leadership role; and those preparing for such responsibility; mentors, tutors, trainers and advisers of the groups mentioned above.

Each book in the series has a cross-phase dimension. This is because the editors believe it is important for teachers in the primary and secondary phases to look at subject teaching holistically, particularly in order to provide for continuity and progression, but also to increase their understanding of how children learn. The balance of chapters that have a cross-phase relevance, chapters that focus on issues which are of particular concern to primary teachers and chapters that focus on issues which secondary teachers are more likely to need to address, varies
according to the issues relevant to different subjects. However, no matter where the emphasis is, authors have drawn out the relevance of their topic to the whole of each book's intended audience.

Because of the range of the series, both in terms of the issues covered and its cross-phase concern, each book is an edited collection. Editors have commissioned new writing from experts on particular issues who, collectively, will represent many different perspectives on subject teaching. Readers should not expect a book in this series to cover a full range of issues relevant to the subject, or to offer a completely unified view of subject teaching, or that every issue will be dealt with discretely, or that all aspects of an issue will be covered. Part of what each book in this series offers to readers is the opportunity to explore the inter-relationships between positions in debates and, indeed, among the debates themselves, by identifying the overlapping concerns and competing arguments that are woven through the text.

The editors are aware that many initiatives in subject teaching currently originate from the centre, and that teachers have decreasing control of subject content, pedagogy and assessment strategies. The editors strongly believe that for teaching to remain a proper vocation and a profession, teachers must be invited to be part of a creative and critical dialogue about subject teaching, and encouraged to reflect, criticise, problem-solve and innovate. This series is intended to provide teachers with a stimulus for democratic involvement in the development of subject teaching.

Susan Capel,
Jon Davison,
James Arthur and
John Moss
May 1999